



## SHEFFIELD CITY COUNCIL

### Full Council

---

**Report of:** Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee

---

**Report to:** Full Council

---

**Date:** 1st July 2015

---

**Subject:** Annual Scrutiny Report

---

**Author of Report:** Matthew Borland, Diane Owens & Emily Standbrook-Shaw  
0114 273 5065

---

#### Summary:

This report provides an overview of scrutiny activity undertaken during the 2014/15 municipal year. It summarises the work done by the Council's 5 Scrutiny & Policy Development Committees:

- Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee
  - Children Young People and Family Support
  - Economic and Environmental Wellbeing
  - Healthier Communities and Adult Social Care
  - Safer and Stronger Communities
- 

#### Recommendations:

Full Council is asked to note the work undertaken through the scrutiny committees.

---

**Background Papers:** None

---

**Category of Report:** OPEN

---

## Statutory and Council Policy Checklist

<b>Financial Implications</b>
NO Cleared by:
<b>Legal Implications</b>
NO Cleared by:
<b>Equality of Opportunity Implications</b>
NO Cleared by:
<b>Tackling Health Inequalities Implications</b>
NO
<b>Human rights Implications</b>
NO:
<b>Environmental and Sustainability implications</b>
NO
<b>Economic impact</b>
NO
<b>Community safety implications</b>
NO
<b>Human resources implications</b>
NO
<b>Property implications</b>
NO
<b>Area(s) affected</b>
<b>Relevant Cabinet Portfolio Leader</b>
<b>Relevant Scrutiny Committee if decision called in</b>
<b>Is the item a matter which is reserved for approval by the City Council?</b>
NO
<b>Press release</b>
NO

## **Scrutiny – Annual Report**

### **1. Summary**

1.1. This report provides an overview of scrutiny activity undertaken during the 2014/15 municipal year. It summarises the work done through formal meetings and task and finish groups of the:

- Children Young People and Family Support
- Economic and Environmental Wellbeing
- Healthier Communities and Adult Social Care
- Safer and Stronger Communities
- Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee

1.2 During 2014/15, the Council's 5 Scrutiny Committees held 28 formal meetings, carried out 1 piece of in-depth policy work, covered 67 subject areas, and considered 5 call-ins. The Committees heard evidence from range of sources including commissioners and providers of health services in Sheffield, Sheffield Youth Parliament, Youth Cabinet, and Young Carers Participation Group, Amey, national and Sheffield based housing developers as well as a range of groups and individuals with an interest in the future role of the city centre. Scrutiny Committee members have undertaken training in questioning and listening skills, and tackling child sexual exploitation.

### **2. What does this mean for Sheffield people**

- 2.1. A challenging and effective scrutiny function is a key contributor to Sheffield achieving its long term goals. The key priorities set out by the Council are reflected in the breadth of issues that Scrutiny Committees look at.
- 2.2. By investigating issues of local concern, reviewing performance against local targets, and making recommendations for improvements in services, scrutiny can ensure that better outcomes are achieved for Sheffield people.
- 2.3. The importance of a robust scrutiny function has been highlighted recently, with both the Francis Inquiry into the Mid-Staffordshire Hospitals failings, and the Jay and Casey reports into Child Sexual Exploitation in Rotherham stressing the importance of challenge through scrutiny. A review of Scrutiny in Sheffield in 2013/14 identified actions for improving the impact and effectiveness of scrutiny. These actions are being implemented to ensure that we strengthen scrutiny to the benefit of all parts of the Council, and the people of Sheffield.

3. **Recommendation**

- 3.1. Full Council is asked to note the work undertaken through the Scrutiny Committees during the 2014/15 municipal year

## Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee Chair: Cllr Chris Weldon

### New Structure

2014/15 saw the structure of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Committee change. Previously comprised of the 4 Chairs and 4 Deputy Chairs of each Scrutiny Committee, membership was expanded to bring the Committee in line with the Council's political proportionality rules.

### Electoral Review of Sheffield

Last year OSMC carried out a 'call for evidence' to help inform the Council's initial submission to the Local Government Boundary Commission's review looking at the size of Sheffield Council, and ward boundaries. The Boundary Commission published their proposals in October, and the OSMC once again invited people to give their views to the Committee. The OSMC heard from several individuals with concerns about the proposals, particularly around suggested changes to boundaries in Highfields. The OSMC asked officers to meet with local ward councillors and members of the public to attempt to find a more satisfactory solution, before responding to the Boundary Commission's consultation.

### Revenue Budget and Capital Programme

OSMC considered the Cabinet's proposals for the 2015/16 Revenue Budget and Capital Programme, raising concerns about the amount of money that the Council has lost through specific grants being rolled up into Revenue Support Grant and then cut, and how Sheffield has fared in comparison to other authorities in terms of reductions in RSG. Officers were asked to do a detailed analysis of this and make the information available to Sheffield MPs.

### Issues Considered

OSMC has kept a watching brief on the Council's revenue budget and corporate performance, particularly performance on the Council's key external contracts with Kier, Veolia, Amey and Capita. The Committee was concerned about the low user satisfaction with the Capita ICT contract and asked for future reports to include information about complaints. The Committee asked the Safer and Stronger Communities Scrutiny Committee to take a closer look at the Kier repairs and maintenance contract, and the Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny Committee to look at performance on the Amey Streets Ahead contract. OSMC received updates on progress with the Scrutiny Review Action Plan, as well as considering what action the Council is taking to increase voter registration in light of the recent introduction of Individual Electoral Registration. Members of the public have attended OSMC meetings and asked questions on a range of issues from webcasting council meetings to Local Area Partnerships to funding public health activity. As a result of comments made by members of the public at OSMC, scrutiny committees have agreed to provide written responses to public questions within 10 working days.

## Children, Young People & Family Support Scrutiny & Policy Development Committee

### Chair: Cllr Gill Furniss

#### Highlights

**Services for Young Carers** - Following a meeting with young people and young carers in April 2014 the Scrutiny Committee requested a report on the services available for young carers in the city. The report was presented in July 2014 and the committee heard from the Director of Children & Families Services at Sheffield City Council, the Managing Director from Sheffield Young Carers and a lead officer from CHILYPEP (Children and Young Peoples Empowerment Project). The committee also heard from the young people themselves via a series of short films that they produced. The films focussed on the rights of young carers and their personal experiences, including their differing experiences of the education system. The committee supported the areas for development as outlined in the report of the Director of Children & Families Services and agreed to write to the Minister of State for Schools and the Shadow Secretary of State for Education to highlight the work of young carers and share the films the young people had produced.

**Children & Families Act 2014** - In January 2015 the committee dedicated its meeting to focusing on the implications of the Children & Families Act 2014. Following some detailed discussions, the committee agreed that a small group of its members would meet with the Assistant Director for Lifelong Learning, Skills & Communities to discuss the challenges posed by Section 3 of the Act which covers provision of education for children and young people who have a special educational need or disability. This enabled the committee members to gain a better understanding of the latest provision in the city for children and young people with autism spectrum disorder (ASD). Members were informed of the new enhanced provision in Sheffield colleges, provision for work placements and the newly commissioned specialist school provision within the city, (the Kenwood centre) which has been set up in response to the growing demand for specialist placements for children with ASD and will allow children and young people to be educated without having to be sent out of Sheffield.

**Citywide Attainment in Schools & Academies** - The committee considered a headline report on attainment in September 2014, followed by a more detailed report in November when additional national comparator data was available. The report detailed educational outcomes from foundation stage through to A Level. The committee acknowledged that although improvements had been made across all key stages there was still considerable work to do to ensure attainment levels continued to improve. The committee also agreed to establish a sub group to meet with officers to look at any performance gaps in connection with the attainment and progress of vulnerable learners. The sub group were happy with progress in this area and fed back their findings at a subsequent meeting.

#### In Brief: Issues Considered

Find papers and minutes of meetings [here](#)

This year the Committee has also considered and commented on:

Building Successful Families Programme (Phase 1 & 2)  
What Services are available for young carers in City of Sheffield  
Refreshing the Child & Household Poverty Strategy

Adoption & Fostering Annual Report  
Academies in Sheffield  
Looked After Children Annual Report

## Special Meetings

### Child Sexual Exploitation Services In Sheffield - Report

The Committee held a special meeting on 15<sup>th</sup> December 2014 to consider the report of Dr Kathryn Houston (Safer Outlook Consulting Ltd.) entitled an "Assessment of Child Sexual Exploitation (CSE) Services in Sheffield". The report detailed the findings of an internal assessment which was undertaken by the Council in response to the independent inquiry into CSE in Rotherham undertaken by Professor Alexis Jay. The Committee asked a wide range of questions and made a number of recommendations, including writing to the Crown Prosecution Service regarding the need for on-going work within the judicial system to raise awareness of CSE and requesting specific training for the committee on statistical interpretation to assist them in their scrutiny role. This training will be delivered in autumn-winter 2015.

### Annual meeting with Young People & Young Carers

Members of the committee met with over 20 young people and young carers in March 2015 to discuss issues of concern to them. The session ran as a series of informal workshops looking at changes to the electoral registration system and engaging with young people, the living wage and pupil voice and support in schools. We are still working with the young people and young carers to identify any action the committee will take as a result of this session.

Page 61

## Testing New Ideas

A number of committee members attended a "**questioning & listening skills**" training session that was held for members of scrutiny in January 2015.

The trainer spoke about different questioning styles and techniques and also suggested that using **preparation meetings** can be an effective tool for scrutiny, as they enable the committee to think about the areas they want to cover and to plan their questioning strategy.

The Committee tested this approach prior to their meeting in December 2015 (to consider the internal assessment of child sexual exploitation services). They have found it a useful way to talk through possible areas of questioning and plan their approach. The Committee decided to continue to use preparation meetings for the remainder of the municipal year.

## Membership & Meetings

The committee is made up of 12 elected Councillors and a number of statutory co-opted education representatives.

In the 2014-15 municipal year these were, 2 Diocesan Representatives and 1 Parent Governor Representative. The committee have also chosen to appoint a School Governor Representative.

The Committee meets bi-monthly and will organise additional special meetings as required.

## Call-In

The committee did not receive any "called in" items this municipal year.

**Economic and Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny & Policy Development Committee**  
**Chair: Cllr Cate McDonald**

**In brief**

The Committee has considered a wide range of issues.

The Council's Client Team and Amey updated the Committee on the Streets Ahead Action Plan on **Street Lighting**, including details of performance. This was a follow up to a previous discussion and Committee members scrutinised progress on this issue.

In September the Committee looked at the **Council's Waste Strategy 2009-2020**. The purpose of the Committee's involvement was to challenge thinking and to have an input into the development of the strategy. In order to do this the session included an external perspective from an Adviser to the national Waste Resources Action Programme (WRAP). The Council's waste contractor, Veolia also took part in the discussion. Officers returned to the Committee in December with more details on potential future options and the financial implications.

The Committee received an update on **Sheffield's Library Services** following the implementation of the new operation model for the City's community libraries. The Committee requested progress be made on leases of buildings to the voluntary sector and received confirmation in the spring that this had happened.

The final meeting considered the topic of '**How Sheffield Presents Itself**' and specifically scrutinised the **International Economic Commission** and the **Sheffield Cultural Consortium's Year of Making 2016**.

**Private Sector House Building**

A Task Group to look at Private Sector Housing Building was established by the Committee. The purpose was to scrutinise the Council's policies and practices to assess whether there were robust arrangements in place to meet the housing challenge, and to identify any additional measures required to facilitate more private sector house building in the City.

The work had three stages. The first was internal evidence gathering including desktop research. This stage involved discussions with Council staff responsible for economic development, housing, and planning. This was in order to understand the context and activity the Council is already doing.

The second stage was external evidence gathering which consisted of focus groups with housing developers to gain a wider understanding of the issues from their perspectives; to hear potential solutions to issues identified; and to provide challenge to the Council's policies and practices.

The final stage was to feedback to Council officers on what the Task Group had heard from developers and to provide challenge based on the issues raised from an external perspective. The Task Group's report went to Cabinet in May 2015. It makes 6 recommendations in the following four areas:

- Land disposal
- Culture
- Transparency / Communications
- City Centre



## Cycling Inquiry

The Committee's Cycling Inquiry report to Cabinet in April 2014 and the Committee considered a formal **response to the Cycling Inquiry from the Cabinet Member** for Business, Skills and Development in July.

In terms of impact of the work the response included the Cabinet Member agreeing that the vision for Cycling should be incorporated into the Council's overall Vision for Excellent Transport in Sheffield and the recommendations implemented as proposed.

It also included an updated Sheffield Cycle Action Plan and plan of the strategic cycle network. A delivery plan would be brought back to Cabinet in summer 2015 along with a progress report on delivery of the Cycle Inquiry Report recommendations.

## Future Role of the City Centre

For this item the Committee tested the economic assumptions that the City Council makes for the future of the city centre. This included taking evidence from Council officers on Sheffield's economy and the work to update the City Centre Masterplan following consultation on the Plan in 2013. The Committee also took evidence from representatives of the private sector in the city involved in property and regeneration; hospitality; and retail.

Following the meeting the Chair wrote to Councillor Leigh Bramall, Cabinet Member for Business, Skills and Development, informing him of the summary of the discussion and raised the Committee's key points

## Call Ins

**An Individual Cabinet Member Decision on Parking Permit Prices** was scrutinised in August 2014. Issues discussed included City Centre permits; benefits for residents; cost in relation to the annual cost of running a vehicle; income from permits; feedback from customers; cost for low emissions vehicles; and how costs for permits had been determined. The Committee agreed to take no further action.

The second was a **decision by the Leader of the Council on Statement of Community Involvement**, which outlines how the Council consults on planning applications and planning policy. Issues discussed included online services; pre-application consultation; approach for controversial applications; and distributing notification letters to residents and businesses. The Committee agreed to take no further action.

A decision by Cabinet acting as Charity Trustees of the **Graves Park Charitable Trust to dispose of Cobnar Cottage** was Called In. The Committee will be considering this early in the 2015/16.

## Air Quality

The Committee looked at the current approach to air quality following the debate in Full Council in November, 2014.

The session included taking evidence from the Council's Air Quality Officer; the Director of Public Health; the East End Quality of Life Initiative; and the bus operator Stagecoach Yorkshire.

## Healthier Communities & Adult Social Care Scrutiny & Policy Development Committee

Chair: Cllr Mick Rooney

### Impact

The Committee had concerns about the **funding of hospice care**, and the ability of hospices to make medium and long term financial plans, given that hospices are reliant on donations. Following discussions at Scrutiny, NHS Sheffield CCG agreed to give St Luke's hospice a 2 year funding agreement for the NHS commissioned elements of the service to help with financial planning.

The **Nutrition and Hydration Working Group** made recommendations to the Teaching Hospitals on standardising food organisation and service. These were taken on board and included in the Trust's Hydration and Nutrition Assurance Toolkit which was launched in November.

The **Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services (CAMHS)** working group agreed its final report, making recommendations on how the care pathway could be improved, and how to better raise the awareness of, signpost and involve young people. Following conversations with the Cabinet Members and the Executive Director, the Scrutiny report will be used as part of a wider evidence base calling for changes to the way CAMH services are delivered, and put to the Health & Wellbeing Board. Read the Scrutiny Committee's report [here](#)

During discussions on the petition opposing the changes to the **Learning Disability Service**, one of the key concerns of petitioners was around the potential erosion of staff terms and conditions should the contract be won by a private provider. Trade Unions were keen to see the adoption of Unison's 'Ethical Care Charter'. The Scrutiny Committee asked officers to work with providers and trade unions to develop a voluntary code of good practice for supported living in Sheffield, drawing on the ethical care charter model.

### In Brief: Issues Considered

Find papers and minutes of meetings [here](#)

This year the Committee has considered and commented on:

NHS Sheffield CCG's Commissioning Intentions

Adult Social Care Local Account

Implementation of the Care Act

End of Life Care

Better Care Fund

Adult Social Care Performance

Adult Safeguarding Partnership Business Plan

Sheffield Health and Wellbeing Board's plans

The city's Dementia Strategy

Right First Time Programme Update

Changes to Minor Oral Surgical Services

Commissioners Working Together Programme

Health Inequalities Action Plan

Developing a social model of public health

## Listening to Public Concerns

In July, a **petition** was presented to the Committee, opposing proposed changes to the Learning Disability Services. The petitioners were particularly concerned about the impact on staff and residents if services currently provided in the public sector, by NHS Sheffield Health and Social Care Trust, were to go to private providers. The Committee talked to the Cabinet Member, Council Officers, affected members of the public, staff and trade union representatives in considering this issue. It was considered again in December, where the Committee agreed with the decision to move to supported living, and has asked to hear from residents and their families, and the independent advocacy service once transition has taken place, to get their views on how successful the process has been.

The Committee has responded to **public questions** on a range of issues over the year including concerns over the way primary care is commissioned and plans for implementing the living wage across the care sector.

The Chair of the Committee has a regular dialogue with the Chair of [HealthWatch Sheffield](#), and a representative of HealthWatch sits on the Committee, enabling the views of public, patients and service users to be fed into Committee discussion

## Statutory Responsibilities

**Quality Accounts** – all providers of NHS services are required to share their annual quality reports with the Committee. In April, the Committee met with the Teaching Hospitals Trust, Health and Social Care Foundation Trust, Children's Hospital and Yorkshire Ambulance Service to consider progress from last year, and quality priority areas for this year.

Where the NHS is consulting on proposals that affect more than one local authority area, councils are required to form joint scrutiny committees. Sheffield has been part of the [Yorkshire and Humber Joint Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee](#) (JHOSC) looking at the **review of congenital cardiac surgical services**. The JHOSC submitted its response to the national consultation on the proposed service specification in December, highlighting concerns over the staffing requirements and affordability of the proposed standards, as well as whether the consultation had been effective in reaching out to ethnic minority groups, who are disproportionately affected by congenital cardiac conditions. The JHOSC will continue to be involved as proposals for the service develop.

## Call-In

The decision to **tender for the reprovision of day services and short term residential beds for people with dementia** was called-in in February.

After hearing from the Cabinet Member, officers, staff and members of the public, the Committee took no further action, as it was satisfied that the decision to tender was appropriate, and that the current provider had the opportunity to submit a proposal that would meet the Council's requirement for the service.

## Safer and Stronger Communities Scrutiny & Policy Development Committee

Chair: Cllr Chris Weldon

### Welfare Reform

The Committee looked at **Council House Building** and the delivery of new and additional Council homes, through either acquisition of house or new build houses. The Committee fed back on the Council's current proposals.

The Committee looked at the **Housing+** model of council housing management and the potential impact for tenants, their households and their communities.

The Committee recognised that Housing+ had been in operation for a short period. It decided to visit the South East of the City, which is operating the 'test phase' of the model to meet tenants and assess the implementation of the Housing+ model in 2015.

The Committee looked at the **Housing Revenue Account (HRA) Business Plan** for 2015/16. This included recent developments and some of the considerations for the Business Plan Update 2015/16. The Committee fed back its comments and these were reflected in the final HRA Business Plan report that went to Cabinet.

The Committee also scrutinised the progress made on implementing the **Social Housing Repairs and Maintenance Contract**.

### Welfare Reform

Since July 2013 the Committee has been receiving regular reports regarding the **impact of welfare reform** and how the Council and others are responding.

The Committee requested officers continue to look at best practice and to provide the information in the report to all Councillors and Sheffield Members of Parliament. The Chair of the Committee sent a copy of the report to the Government Minister in the Department of Work and Pensions.

### Challenge for Change

The customer scrutiny panel known as Challenge for Change (C4C) was set up to perform an independent review of services delivered by the Council Housing Service (formerly Sheffield Homes).

A group of tenants presented their report on Community Engagement to the Committee. The Committee requested a report back focusing on progress made on the twelve issues identified in the report, and will be inviting tenants representatives to take part in the discussion.

A Challenge for Change Grass Cutting Report had been presented by tenants to the Committee in 2013 and a report back on the Council's response to the report's recommendations was provided in November 2014.

The Committee asked the relevant Cabinet Members to consider the way in which the Service Level Agreement operates, particularly in relation to charges and value for money and to look at how uniform service could be provided where possible.

## Community Safety

The Committee dedicated one meeting to focus on community safety issues. This included the Safer and Sustainable Communities Partnership; the Police and Crime Commissioner; Police and Crime Panels; the Joint Strategic Intelligence Assessment (JSIA); Partnership Plan Priorities 2014/15; performance, achievements, challenges; the budget; and the Anti-Social Behaviour, Crime and Police Act 2014.

Given the changes, particularly regarding anti-social behaviour the Committee requested a briefing paper for all Councillors and a training session for all Councillors on community safety.

The Committee also considered **Domestic and Sexual Abuse** in Sheffield with members of the Children, Young People and Family Support Scrutiny Committee invited to attend.

Page 67

## Call In

A decision on **'Future options for the Housing Repairs and Maintenance Service'** was Called In.

After consideration the Committee recommended that no further action be taken. It did request information on the full costings of holding a ballot of tenants and leaseholders on insourcing the Housing Repairs and Maintenance Service, together with, other fully-costed consultation options. The Committee will be inviting tenants representatives to their meeting to discuss this.

## Police and Crime Panel links

The Committee's remit includes Community Safety and part of its work has been to build links with the South Yorkshire Police and Crime Panel. The Panel's role is to scrutinise and hold to account the Police and Crime Commissioner for South Yorkshire.

Cllr Roy Munn was one of the Council's representatives on the Panel was also a member of the Scrutiny Committee and provided a link between the two bodies.

The Committee agreed a Protocol with the Panel that covers sharing of information and how the Committee can request the Panel to consider item. It also includes how the Committee can comment on the Commissioner's Police and Crime Plan.

## In Brief

The Committee has also requested a number of written updates where it wants to be kept up to speed on particular topics

- Right to Buy figures
- Partner Resources Allocation Meeting
- Welfare Reform
- Local Area Partnerships and Community Engagement
- Land management arrangements
- Progress on Implementation of the Housing Allocations Policy

This page is intentionally left blank